PROJECT
(Professional Journal of English Education)
Volume 6, No. 4, July 2023
p–ISSN 2614-6320
e–ISSN 2614-6258

# AN ANALYSIS OF CATEGORY SHIFT IN SUBTITLE ALICE IN WONDERLAND MOVIE BY TIM BURTON

**Asyita Anisni[1], Evert H. Hilman[2]**

English Literature Study Program, Universitas Nasional, Indonesia
[1] 2019.asyita.anisni@student.unas.ac.id, [2] evhilman@gmail.com

## Abstract

The purpose of this research was conducted to prove whether "translation shift" is still relevant to convey messages in translation with this strategy to procedure relatively accurate translation, and what types and shift categories can help researchers convey messages from the source language to the target language. This research uses descriptive qualitative research by collecting and analyzing Indonesian and English subtitles from Alice in Wonderland movie by Tim Burton using J.C Catford's theory of translation shift. This paper produced 462 data. which were analyzed qualitatively to determine the types of translation shifts employed. There are 48% structure shifts, 5% class shifts, 35% unit shifts, and 12% intra-system. Based on the data analyzed, the most dominant shift that occurs is the structure shift.

**Keywords**: Movie; Translation Shift; Translation Quality Assessment; Subtitle

## INTRODUCTION

Many researchers have made movie as data material analyzed from various categories for analysis. Because based on its role and function, movie can be a media for learning, especially learning languages. Starting from transferring values, ideas and information from certain cultures verbally, visually and orally. However, in order to transfer values, ideas and information to an audience, movies need to be translated. (Newmark, 1988:7) states that Translation is a process of transferring messages, thoughts or even meaning from the source language to the target language. The translation is not only conveying meaning from one language to another. The translation conveys meaning, moral and immoral issues. Translation is a means of communication by itself, or directed to the present by two reciprocal languages. In the translation activity of course there are some things that need to be considered, and one of them is word choice. It is very important to make the translation results not read ambiguously. There are several aspects related to structural, linguistic, or cultural aspects that must be considered so that the translation can be accepted and clear. Therefore, the translator is required to provide an 'accurate' representation of the original to the reader, free from 'distortions', without imposing their personal values, or their own culture, on other people's intellectual products, such as structures, linguistics, or even cultural, so that the translation can be accepted and read by the Target Language (TL), researchers about the difficulties and problems faced by translators to understand translation theory, want to highlight the application of translation theory. from Catford, "The Translation Shift", which will be used to analyze the subtitles of Alice in Wonderland. Variations in translation shifts, translation quality assessment, and analysis will be explained in this article, followed by an explanation of the move about sentences, words, phrases, or even clauses in question. The purpose of this study is to investigate how translation shifts are used in translating meaning in the movie subtitle and how these shifts help the writer in conveying messages from SL to TL even though there are cultural differences between the two languages (English to Indonesian). The movie subtitles can be a function to understand content you are watching. It will really help the audience to understand

the message to be conveyed. Of course, this will not only enhance the viewing experience, but the audience will also be able to feel and understand the emotions of the characters in the movie. The power of subtitles on movie can be enormous. With translation will help communicate with those who do not speak the same language. In translation subtitling, the translator finds a unique indication, that is the source text is a spoken text which is supported by backgrounds, musical illustrations, character expressions, etc., and the translator must translate the spoken text into written text. Regarding to the synopsis of the movie, Alice is a girl who at that time was 19 years old, and she returned to the magical land of Wonderland. Here, her old friends make her realize that she is meant to end the reign of the evil Red Queen. The aim of this research is to examine the shift in categories which are limited to four shifts; Structure shift, Class shift, Unit shift and Intra-system shift approaches using (Catford, 1965) as the main theory and other theories assist along with Newmark and (Chesterman, 2016). Then evaluate the translation quality assessment in terms of acceptability, accuracy and readability using the theory of Nababan et al, (2012). Catford (1965:73) stated that translation shift is that a change occurs or can occur in the translation process so that a shift in order is formed. This is due to the attempt to embody the systematic difference between the Source Language and the Target Language. Catford (1978) states that "by shift we mean the departure from formal correspondence in the process of going from the SL to the TL"(p.73). The whole idea of making translations readable and palatable is the main concern of translators. Many authors have previously written or researched the same topic. Donatus Darso conducted one of this studies in 2018 with his paper entitled "Category Shifts in Translation: A Case Study on The Translation of English Complex Noun Phrases into Indonesian" This paper findings reveal that there are four category shifts: structure shift, class shift, intra-system shift, and unit shift. The researcher found that Structure shift occurs in the highest frequency of 339 cases or about 66,86% out of total 507 cases, class shift occurs 75 cases or 14,79% out of total 507 cases, and intra-system shift occurs 48 cases or 9,46% out of total 507 cases, and unit shift occurs 45 cases or 8,87 % out of total 507 cases.Then there's Dianti Puspaningrum's research from the Muhammadiyah Surakarta University conducted research on "Translation Shift and Translation Procedure Found in Avocat Story Book". In her research, she identified the types of translation shifts found in the AvoCat storybook and explained the translation procedures used in the AvoCat storybook and also in her research, she showed that there were 424 shifts in the form of 13 (3.07%) data classified into word class shifts, 98 (23.11%) data classified as intra-system shifts, 138 (32.55%) data classified into level shifts and 175 (41.27%) data were classified into structure shifts. This research has some similarities with the previous studies. The similarities are that this research employs translation shift established by Catford's theory. In addition, other related theories are used in the research to support the data analysis. Based on the previous study, it can be concluded that this research is different because it uses the movie subtitle Alice in Wonderland as the data.

## METHOD

The objective of this research is to classify the types of Category Shifts in English subtitles and to identify each translation shifts occur in translating the subtitles in Alice in Wonderland movie using Catford's theory. This study used descriptive qualitative method to describe phenomenon of translation shifts, types of category shifts used in Subtitle Alice in Wonderland movie. Based on Bogdan and Taylor in Moleong (2010:4) define "qualitative methods as research procedures that produce descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from people and observable behavior". The data was also investigated using a library approach. According to Kothari (1990:7) library research is recording of notes, Content analysis, Tape and Film listening, and records analysis. The data in this study refers to the information that

researcher collect for research. Data is the basic material that needs to be processed to produce information. The main data source in this research is the text itself. Some information from other books and the internet is also needed to complete this research. The data of this research are utterances that are produced from movie script "Alice in Wonderland (2010)". The analysis begins with a thorough review of the main source data, observing a shift along with the Indonesian translation from the Indonesian subtitle version. The next step in this research is to sort all of the data into the translation shift category using Catford's theory. The supporting theory is then also used to create a more reliable analysis. Then encourage researcher to start analyzing and interpreting the data. Also read through all the data to get an idea of general description of what was obtained so that the researcher can organize it properly. Furthermore, this study will classify all data into different categories using the Catford's theory. The transmitted data is described in the following step. Finally, to facilitate interpretation, it is necessary to expressly indicate what is the contextual basis or understanding of these categories and what distinguishes one category from another.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Results

Based on the data analysis, the researcher found that some items can be analyzed using the translation strategy of category shift by Catford's theory. There are at least 462 utterances produced by each character in the movie, as well as classifications of the translation shifts used for each utterance, in this study. This study discovered 4 types of category shifts. Table 1 also shows the results and data of the translation shifts based on all utterances in the English subtitle text of "Alice in Wonderland." The researcher analyzed both the original and translated utterances to get the data. The researcher counted each type of translation shifts to determine the frequency. Using the formula, the researcher calculated the percentage of each translation shifts occur frequency.

**Table 1.** Classification results table

| Translation Shift | Frequency | Percentage |
|---|---|---|
| Structure Shift | 225 | 48 % |
| Class Shift | 21 | 5 % |
| Unit Shift | 163 | 35 % |
| Intra-System Shift | 53 | 12% |
| Total | 462 | 100 % |

The data in the table showed that the researcher identify four category translation shifts. There are Structure Shifts, Class Shifts, Unit Shifts, and Intra-System Shifts. There are 225 structure shifts, 21 class shifts, 163 unit shifts, and 53 intra-system. The frequency with which data appears the most is in the structure shift, which is 225 times.

### Discussion

**Structure Shift**

**Data 1**

SL : "**Squimberry Juice**".
TL : *"**Jus Squimberry**"*.

The translation of the SL **"Squimberry Juice"** shifts into a different sequence in the TL ***"Jus Squimberry"*** which verifies the different type of translation-shift, namely **structure shift.** The phrase **"Squimberry juice"** in the source language consists of Modifier+Head (MH) pattern, modifier **"Squimberry"** and head **"Juice".** In SL, the head word comes after the modifiers but it is positioned before modifiers in TL. It is translated into ***"Jus Squimberry"***, which consists of Head+Modifier (HM) pattern; head ***"Jus"*** and modifier ***"Squimberry".*** Based on the translation shift theory put forward by Catford (1965:77), it is called a structure shift where the grammatical position changes in the target language. As stated by Catford's theory (1965) "Structure-shifts can be found at other ranks, for example at group rank. In translation … a shift from MH (modifier + head) to (M)HQ ((modifier +) head + qualifier),…" (p.78). In addition, another expert (Chesterman 2016:97) stated that **ST scheme X → TT scheme X.** That is, if the ST scheme is judged to be relevant to the Target Language. Therefore, it can be (to some extent) preserved.

As for the translation assessment, by Nababan. In terms of accuracy, the translation is considered accurate and scored level 3 as it follows the rules, norms, or culture of the TL. We can see that the option to translate the SL **"Squimberry Juice"** into the target text (TL) ***"Jus Squimberry"*** is accurate. as it preserves the meaning, situation, and message of the sentence. In terms of acceptability, the translation is considered acceptable with a score 3 looking into the naturalness, the usage of the technical terms, and the familiarity of the phrase to the reader in which it is in accordance with the rules of the Indonesian language (Nababan, 2012: 44). And in terms of readability, the score is 3 or readable because the translation is easy to understand without having to read it more than once or referring to the previous sentence or the next sentence (Nababan et al., 2012: 51).

**Data 2**

SL : "Now everything **will have to be rushed through!**"

TL : "*Sekarang semuanya **harus berjalan dengan buru-buru**".*

The translation of the SL **" will have to to be rushed through!"** shifts into a different structure in the TL ***" …harus berjalan dengan buru-buru"***. A **structure shift** happens in the translation of a passive voice SL **"to be rushed"** as the subject gets the action into an active sentence in TL ***"berjalan"*** where the subject is pronoun or thing responsible for the verb's activity. As stated by (Moeliono et.al., 2017) "Verba aktivitas tindakan menggambarkan perbuatan yang dinamis..." (p.96). According to (Catford, 1965:77), a structural shift involves a change in grammatical structure between the source language (SL) and the target language (TL). For example, switching from active to passive, finite to infinite, or the clause constituent. This is the most common form of shift that occurs in the translation process as it is related to grammatical shifts. In addition, This structure shift also stated by (Chesterman 2016:94) as **clause structure change** where changes that have to do with the structure of the clause in terms of its constituent phrases… active vs. passive voice…

The above analysis fulfills its quality parameters in which, according to (Nababan, et.al, 2012: 44), The score for this is 3 because the information in TL is accurate. "word meaning, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or source text are translated accurately into target text; no meaning distortion takes place." The translation is included in the acceptable level of translation because all words are translated correctly. The score for this acceptable is 3 because no translation errors were found in the data. In terms of readability, the application of shift translation theory makes it easier for readers to grasp the meaning of translated sentences, because from SL to TL translations are there is no need to fritter away or exert energy and time

or effort to switch from one dictionary to another to find out the meaning so it doesn't require extra effort to digest the information and the score for this level is 3.

**Class Shift**

**Data 3**

SL : "Don't most people have different **dreams**?"

TL : "*Bukankah kebanyakan orang **bermimpi** hal yang berbeda-beda?"*

From the data above, the translation **"…dreams"** of the SL shifts into a different word **class** in TL ***"…bermimpi…"***. In the data above, The source language consists of the word **"…dreams"** (plural noun) and translated into ***"…bermimpi…"*** (verb) according to thesaurus Bahasa Indonesia (2008:321) *bermimpi v berasian, berangan-angan, melamun, mengangan, mengkhayal;* There is a class shift in this translation. It is a change in word class from plural noun "…dreams" in SL to verb ***"…bermimpi…"*** in TL. As stated by Catford, a class shift is a shift that occurs when the equivalent translation of an SL element becomes a member of a different class than the original element. This means that SL has a different class from TL (Catford, 1965: 78). In Chesterman (2016) theory explains that the changes that occur in word classes are called **transpositions**. "From noun to verb, adjective to adverb. Normally, this strategy obviously involves structural changes as well, but it is often useful to isolate the word-class change as being of interest in itself" (p.93).
According to the translation assessment by Nababan, there are three aspects that must be emphasized when assessing the quality of translation results: accuracy, acceptability, and readability (Nababan, et.al, 2012: 44). In terms of accuracy, the translated text is accurate and the score is 3 because it follows the rules, norms or culture of the Indonesian language (Nababan et al., 2012:51). Moreover, the same situation occurs after the acceptance level. The score is 3 for acceptability. Last but not least, the readability score is 3, because the SL "notice" makes sense in terms of readability, as it doesn't require extra effort to digest the meaning or understand the message being translated in its entirety.

**Data 4**

SL : "Charles, you have finally **lost** your senses".

TL : *"Charles, kau sudah **kehilangan** akal sehatmu"*.

As can be seen from the data above, the translation of SL **"lost"** shifts into a different word class in TL ***"kehilangan"*** . The shift of a verb **"lost"** (the present tense of this verb is to 'lose') into a noun ***"kehilangan"*** as stated inside the (KBBI: page 545) *"hilang" n: lenyap; tidak ada lagi; hal hilangnya sesuatu; kematian.* Based on the translation shifts theory proposed by Catford, this is called **class shift**. In addition, using Chesterman's theory(2016): **tranposition**, the shifting from the verb **"lost"** in the SL into a noun ***"kehilangan"*** in the TL, is also possible since it gives the same function. Further, he stated that "… this term …to mean any change of word-class, e.g. from noun to verb, adjective to adverb" (p.93). And as according to Thesaurus Bahasa Indonesia *"kehilangan n 1 kematian, kelenyapan, kemusnahan, putus (pencaharian); 2 kerugian"* (p.190). In addition, for the noun ***"kehilangan"*** made up of a group of nouns that are affixed with the confix *"ke-...-an"* and the noun of ***"kehilangan"*** *"merupakan verba yang berasal dari verba dasar tak transitif"* as stated inside (Moeliono et.al., 2017:167).
The score for the accuracy level of the translation is 3, apart from the translation of the verb "…**lost**…" in SL to the noun "…***kehilangan***…" in TL (Nababan et al., 2012: 50). For

acceptability the score is 3 or acceptable because it follows Indonesian rules, norms or culture, … (Nababan et al., 2012: 51). In terms of readability, the score is 3 or readable because the translation is easy to understand without having to read it more than once (Nababan et al., 2012: 51).

**Unit Shift**

**Data 5**

SL : "To me, a corset is like a **codfish**".

TL : *"Bagiku, korset seperti* ***ikan kod****"***.**

In the data above, the SL **"codfish"** shifts into a different unit in TL ***"ikan kod"***. It consists of the compound noun **"codfish"** (compound noun) made up of noun +noun and translated into noun phrase ***"ikan kod"*** made up of head word ***"ikan"*** (noun) + (noun)***"kod"***. There is a **unit shift** in this translation. According to Catford (1965) "By unit-shift we mean changes of rank--that is, departures from formal correspondence in which the translation equivalent of a unit at one rank in the SL is a unit at a different rank in the TL" (p.79). It is a change in unit from lower rank word "compound noun" in SL to higher rank "noun phrase" in TL. Additionally, according to Chesterman (2016:93) this type of translation involves one of the main syntactic strategies, i.e. unit shift, quoted a term from (Catford, 1965): "The units are: morpheme, word, phrase, clause, sentence, paragraph. A unit shift occurs when a ST unit is translated as a different unit in the TT".

As for the translation assessment, by Nababan. In terms of accuracy, the translation is considered accurate and is scored level 3 because it complies with rules, norms or culture of the TL. The acceptability of the translation is include in the acceptable translation level, the score for this is 3, because there are no errors in translating the data. The score parameter was based on the readability of the translation, as mentioned by (Nababan, 2012: 51) and the score is 3 as it mention the SL messages are well written in terms of readability, making it easy for readers to understand the meaning without having to read it more than once or refer to the previous or the next sentences.

**Data 6**

SL : "Oh. **Never mind!**"

TL : "*Oh.* ***Sudahlah!****"*

As can be seen that the SL "**Never mind!"** shifts into a different **unit** in TL ***"Sudahlah!"***. It consists of interjectional phrase made up of **"never"** (adverb) and followed by **"mind"** (noun) translated into interjection word ***"sudahlah!"*** in TL, as stated in the (KBBI: 595 "interjeksi": *interjeksi n kata seru, kata yang mengungkapkan seruan perasaan.* According to thesaurus bahasa Indonesia the adverb *"sudah", sudah: adv; telah, pernah, sudah*.(p.471). The *-lah* particle in TL is an imperative that is used to soften the tone of the command, according to (Moeliono et.al., 2017) *"partikel -lah yang berbentuk klitika dipakai dalam kalimat imperative atau kalimat deklaratif. Dalam kalimat imperatif, -lah dipakai untuk menghaluskan nada perintah yang terkandung dalam kalimat itu"*(p.405).

It is clearly seen that there is an occurrence of **unit shift**. The interjectional phrase in SL is higher in rank is shifted into TL as interjection word which is lower in rank. Based on the theory of translation shift proposed by Catford, this example is categorized into a unit shift.

In terms of accuracy, the translation is considered accurate and gets a score of 3 because it is in accordance with TL rules, norms or culture. SL has been translated accurately into TL and has no distortion or omission of meaning in the message as mentioned by (Nababan, 2012.51). In terms of acceptability, the translation includes an acceptable level of translation because all words have been translated correctly. The score for this is 3 because there are no errors in the translation because the assessment parameters are based on the acceptability of the translation, whether SL is translated naturally into TL and is grammatically correct, or refers to Indonesian grammar rules. as mentioned by (Nababan, 2012. 51). The last aspect is readability. Changes in translation to TL are well conveyed, the point for this is 3 according to (Nababan, 2012.51): Messages are translated naturally as interpretations of words, technical terms, phrases, sentences or texts that maintain SL intent.

**Intra-System Shift**

**Data 7**

SL : "You could always paint the **roses** red".

TL : *"Kau bisa mengecatnya menjadi **mawar** merah"*.

The example above is an example of an **intra-system shift**. As can be seen that the sentence in SL is "You could always paint the **roses** red" consisting of (plural noun) **"roses"** and it is translated into TL *"kau bisa mengecatnya menjadi **mawar** merah"* which consists of ***"mawar"*** (singular noun). According to Catford (1978), "in each language, the system operates in nominal groups. The system is one of two terms, they are singular and plural..." (p.80). A change from plural to singular refers to an intra-system shifts, Catford (1965) stated that "a finite set of alternant, among which a choice must be made"(p.7). For example, the system of pronouns or numerals is a system of nominal groups (as in English). The intra-system shifts carried out to consider the acceptability of the source text (SL) in the target text (TL). In this data, there is an intra-system shift where the word roses (plural) in the SL is translated into ***"mawar"*** which is the singular noun form in the TL. Based on the theory of shift proposed by Catford, this is classified as an **intra-system shift**, namely changes that occur internally within a system. In addition, according to Chesterman (2016) this type of translation involves one of the main syntactic strategies, namely **phrase structure change** "this strategy, or rather a group of strategies, comprises a number of changes at the level of the phrase, including number…"(p.93).
The translation accuracy score is 3, apart from the plural "...**roses**..." in SL to the singular "...***mawar***..." in TL (Nababan et al., 2012: 50). For acceptability, the score is 3 or acceptable because it follows Indonesian rules, norms or culture, both macro and micro (Nababan et al., 2012: 51). In terms of readability, the score is 3 or readable because the translation is easy to understand without having to read it more than once or referring to the previous sentence or the next sentence (Nababan et al., 2012: 51).

**Data 8**

SL : "Don't **most people** have different dreams?"

TL : *"Bukankah **kebanyakan orang** bermimpi hal yang berbeda-beda?"*

As seen in the data of the category shift above, the SL shifts in a different a **system** of nominal groups into TL. According to Catford (1978), "in each language, the system operates in nominal

groups. The system is one of two terms, they are singular and plural...” (p.80). The noun phrase in the SL is **"most people"** which consists of the quantifier **"most"**, the head word **"people"**(plural noun). While it is translated into TL is ***"kebanyakan orang"*** made up of head word ***“orang”*** (singular noun) and preceded by quantifier ***“kebanyakan”***. As according to (Moeliono et.al., 2017)) the word ***“kebanyakan”*** made up of head word ***“banyak”*** which has function as indefinite principal numeralia, *“Yang termasuk kedalam numeralia tak tentu adalah banyak, berbagai… Numeralia pokok taktentu ditempatkan dimuka nomina yang diterangkannya.”* (p.362). And followed by confix *“ke-…-an”*. It can be seen here that the plural noun in the SL **"people"** is shifted into a singular noun ***"orang"*** in the TL. This is done because in Indonesian grammar, if a certain noun is preceded by a quantifier indicating plurality, then the noun in question must be in the singular form. Otherwise, it is redundancy.
The translation accuracy score is 3 regardless of the translation of the noun phrase “...**most people**...” in SL to the word “...***kebanyakan orang***...” in TL, (Nababan et al., 2012: 50). For acceptability, the score is 3 or acceptable because it follows Indonesian rules, norms, or culture (Nababan et al., 2012: 51). In terms of readability, the score is 3 or readable because the translation is easy to understand without having to read it more than once or referring to the previous or next sentence (Nababan et al., 2012: 51).

## CONCLUSION

This research has found 4 types of category shifts used in the translation of Alice in Wonderland Movie by Tim Burton. The types of category shifts are structure shifts, class shifts, unit shifts, and intra-system shifts. For the assessment of the translation quality, it is shown that all data have a high score of accuracy. From the results and discussion it can be concluded that the dominant translation shift is the structure shift. By shifting, the translator is able to keep the SL message. It makes the translation more accurate and acceptable to the target readers.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

All praise be to the almighty God. With His grace and permission I can finally finish my journal properly. I would like to say thank to my self, my family, friends and my special one who have supported me from the beginning of my studies until now. And my deepest thank you to my lecturer who have helped me along the way. I wouldn't complete this journal without their help and support. And I dedicate this study to the people who have always been my biggest supporters.

## REFERENCES

Bogdan, R., Taylor, S. J., & DeVault, M. L. (2010). *Introduction to Qualitative Research Methods* (4th ed.). Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data.

Burton Tim. (2010). *Alice in Wonderland*. https://kaisar21.live/nonton-alice-in-wonderland-2010-sub-indo/

Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford University Press.

Chesterman, A. (2016). *Memes of Translation The spread of ideas in translation theory* (Vol. 123). www.benjamins.com/catalog/btl

Darso, D. (2018). *Category Shifts in Translation: A Case Study on The Translation of English Complex Noun Phrases into Indonesian*. *25*(1).

Finnolius, C. Y. (2019). *The Analysis of Translation Unit Shift in The Subtitle of “Glass” Movie*. Buddhi Dharma University.

Kothari, C. R. (1990). *Research Methodology Methods and Techniques*. New Age International Publisher.

Moeliono, A. M., & Indonesia. Badan Pengembangan dan Pembinaan Bahasa. (2017). *Tata bahasa baku bahasa Indonesia*.

Nababan, M., & Santosa, R. (2018). *Translation Techniques and Their Impact on The Readability of Translated Bible Stories for Children Teknik Penerjemahan Dan Dampaknya Terhadap Keterbacaan Terjemahan Cerita Alkitab Anak*. *17*(2). https://doi.org/10.24036/humanus.v17i2.102729

Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. In Prentice Hall International . https://doi.org/10.1177/0003065114525045

Puspaningrum, D. (2020). *Translation Shift and Translation Procedure Found in Avocat Story Book.*

Redaksi, T. (2008). *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia*. Pusat Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan Nasional.

Redaksi Tim. (2008). *Tesaurus Bahasa Indonesia*. Pusat Bahasa, Departemen Pendiidkan Nasional.